VARIETIES OF ENVIRONMENTALISM
(cont’d – slides based on JMA presentation)

• We separate between a) Conservationism b) Eco-efficiency c) Environmentalism of the Poor

• Here we will focus on the third one, at a more general level on, Environmental Justice including the Environmentalism of the Poor and the Indigenous.

SUNITA NARAIN (CSE) INDIA

Virtually all infrastructure and industrial projects — from mining to thermal and hydel and nuclear power to cement or steel — are under attack today from local communities who fear loss of livelihoods. These communities today are at the forefront of India’s environmental movement. For them environment is not a matter of luxury …

Sunita Narain, 2011

They know that when the land is mined and trees are cut, their water source dries up or they lose grazing and agricultural fields. They know they are poor. But they are saying, loudly and as clearly as they can, what we call development will only make them poorer. This is what I have called the environmentalism of the poor.

Why do people protest?

• The distribution of burdens and benefits, and the struggle over burdens and risks given scientific uncertainties

• Rights in terms of environmental conservation and preserving cultural integrity; indigenous rights and moral values

• Participation in decision-making on local development and the environmental
Social Metabolism (revisited)

- Energy cannot be recycled, therefore even an economy that would not grow but that would use large amounts of fossil fuels, would need “fresh” supplies coming from the commodity frontiers.

- The same applies to materials, which in practice can be recycled only to some extent (like copper, aluminium, steel or paper).

- When the economy grows, the search for materials and energy sources is of course even greater.

Social Metabolism (revisited)

There is “accumulation by dispossession” (Harvey, 2003)

...and there is “accumulation through contamination”, meaning that profits increase by the ability to dispose of the “effluents of affluence” and other waste at zero or low cost.

This does not indicate so much a market failure but rather a cost-shifting success.

From metabolic flows to ecological distribution conflicts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographical Scope</th>
<th>Local</th>
<th>National and Regional</th>
<th>Global</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Extraction</td>
<td>Resource conflicts in tribal areas, such as bauxite mining in Odisha, oil extraction in Amazonia</td>
<td>Mangrove-uprooting, Tree planting for support, Collapse of fisheries</td>
<td>Worldwide search for minerals and fossil fuels, and bio-piracy by MNCs, Regulation of “corporate accountability”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Trade</td>
<td>Complaints on urban motorways because of noise, pollution, landscape loss</td>
<td>Inter-basin water transport, Oil pipelines (e.g. Burma to Thailand)</td>
<td>Oil spills at sea, “Ecologically unequal exchange” because of large South to North material flows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste disposal and pollution, post-consumption</td>
<td>Conflicts on incinerators (dioxins) or some in urban areas</td>
<td>Acid rain from sulphur dioxide, Nuclear waste, Yucca Mountain, Nevada, USA, Ship dismantling (Bang)</td>
<td>CO2, CFC as causes of climate change; ocean layer destruction, POPs even in remote pristine areas, Claims for a “carbon debt”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ecological Dist Conflicts

- The largest waste disposal conflict is over dumping sites for excess CO2.
- There are also conflicts over the application of new technologies (cyanide in open pit gold mining, GMOs, nuclear energy, Geo-engineering) that cause uncertain risks that are unfairly distributed (Pereira and Funtowicz, 2009).
- There is SLA (science-led-activism: the example of CRIIRAD) (Conde, 2013).
- Need for statistics of environmental conflicts, for research on their causes (main cause: the growth of social metabolism?).
Environmental Liabilities and the courts

- Ecological Debts = Environmental Liabilities.
- A concept all the time better known. Some times liabilities can be translated into a money payment (compensatory and punitive) for damages.
- Sometimes, this is difficult – present value of damage to future generations? Present value of disappearing unknown species?
- Civil or criminal cases? Xstrata in La Alumbrera (Argentina), perhaps there will be a criminal court case. Also, 2012 criminal asbestos case Italy (Stephan Schmidheiny).

Claims for payment of environmental liabilities

- The economy works in practice by shifting costs to poor people, to future generations, and to other species.
- Sometimes, environmental liabilities appear in the public scene when there are complaints, or when there are sudden accidents (BP in the Gulf of Mexico, 2010, TEPCO in Fukushima, 2011).
- The pedagogy of catastrophes. *Catastrophisme éclairé* (Jean Pierre Dupuy).
The movements of the environmentalism of the poor

• Introduce local referendums on mining (Esquel, Tambogrande) ....
• or develop new plans for leaving fossil fuels in the ground as in the Yasuni ITT oilfields in Ecuador.
• Attempts have been made to bring Shell to court in The Hague for what it does in the Niger Delta or Chevron-Texaco for what it did in Ecuador.

Remember
The Chevron-Texaco case in Ecuador

• On 14th February 2011, a court decision in Sucumbios, Ecuador, fined Chevron Texaco with USD 9.500 million that would be doubled unless Chevron apologized within 15 days to the victims of pollution.

The items in the compensation
• USD 600 million for cleaning up groundwaters
• USD 5.396 million to clean up the soils in and around the wastewater ponds (based on the area in question).
• USD 200 million (10 million per year for 20 years) to recuperate flora and fauna
• USD 150 million to bring drinkable water into the area.
• USD 1.400 milliones for damages which cannot be repaired such as lost health
• USD 100 million for cultural damages to indigenous groups and for “ethnic restoration”
• USD 800 million to improve public health in the area.
• Then, 10% on top of the above sums was granted to the Frente de Defensa de la Amazonia for management expenditures.

When is money valuation appropriate?

• Money valuation is the appropriate language in court cases for liability...
• Money valuation is only one of several “valuation languages” available. For instance, recent decisions of shale gas fracking in France. Which valuation languages are deployed? Decisions on shale gas in Romania, on Rosia Montana?
• Consider the Vendanta case in the Niyamgiri hill below. Are livelihood, tribal territorial rights, the loss of unique biodiversity... commensurable with money?
Valuation Languages

• Who has the right (or the power) to simplify complexity and impose one language of valuation?

• Incommensurability of values is at the root of ecological economics (JMA, Ecological Economics, 1987).

Alliance between the EJOs (environmental justice organizations) and the small Degrowth movement in Europe